

Basingstoke Canal Options Appraisal

Evaluating the options against the success criteria

Appendix 2

Criteria	Option 1: Unchanged Management					Option 2: Management by a third party				Option 3: Stop or limit use of the Canal		
	1a: Cutting the level of service	1b: Funding from other committees	1c: Removal of riparian funding from District councils	1d: Formalise funding agreement	1e: Source new funding via grants etc.	2a: British Waterways	2b: National Trust	2c: Other existing trust, such as Surrey Wildlife Trust	2d: Set up independent body such as Charitable Trust, Private Company, Park Authority	3a: Substantially close the Canal as a navigation and recreational asset	3b: Retain water, but stop through boat movements	3c: Retain water and Woodham Locks, but stop through boat movements
Financial sustainability/cost effectiveness	3	Income generation option rather than management option	5	1	Income generation option rather than management option	2	2	Combine 2d as trust status	3	5	2	Workshop attendees felt same as option 3b
Structural integrity	3		5	2		2	3		3	2		
Environmental value	2		5	2		2	2		3	4		
Accessibility – use of towpath and recreational asset	3		5	2		2	2		2	5		
User representation and support	1		5	1		2	2		2	5		
Navigation	1		5	1		2	3		3	5		
Total evaluated score	13	0	30	9	0	12	14	0	16	26	17	0

Evaluation mechanism:

1	Fully meets the criteria
2	Meets the criteria in part
3	Marginally meets the criteria

4	Does not meet the criteria
5	Adverse impact on criteria